



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Linda Williams (Chair), Dawn Hill-Holdgate (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, David Barham, Diane Coombs
Associate Commissioners: Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Abigail Camp **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, November 12, 2013 – NEW BUSINESS

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room –5:00 p.m.

Called to order at 5:01 p.m.

Staff in attendance: M. Voigt, HDC Administrator; T. Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp

Absent Members: Hill-Holdgate

Late Arrivals: None

Early Departures: Leonardo-Finger 6:08 p.m.; McLaughlin 8:55 p.m.

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

PLEASE SEE PAGE 2 FOR ITEMS WITH AN ASTERISK

1. Dreamland Theatre – 60550	17 S Water Street – HSAB	New sign: wall sign	42.3.1-11.1	T. Finnerty
2. Dreamland Theatre – 60551	17 S Water Street – HSAB	New sign: wall sign	42.3.1-11.1	T. Finnerty
3. Nantucket Real Estate Ap – 60552	26 Washington St – HSAB	New sign:	42.3.2-23	
4. Doughan, Susan – 60553 *	16 Orange Street – HSAB	Rev: COA #60125	* 42.3.2-14	CWA
5. Upland Corp. – 60554	20 Straight Wharf – HSAB	Fenestration changes	42.3.1-86	Emeritus
6. Great Point Properties – 60555	1 N Beach Street – HSAB	Covered porch	42.4.1-90	Emeritus
7. Schwab, William – 60556	41 N Liberty St – HSAB	Rev: COA #59536	41-159	Botticelli & Pohl
8. FAO Nom Trust – 60557	3 Cash's Court – HSAB	Demo storage	72.3.2-150	Permits Plus
9. Lynch, Helen – 60558	11 Milk Street – HSAB	Revision to COA	42.3.3-84	Rowland & Assoc
10. E.M.R.E. Corp – 60559	7 S. Water Street – HSAB	Storms	42.3.1-131	R. Scheide
11. Bednar, Andrew – 60560 *	38 Orange Street – HSAB	Color change	* 42.3.2-221	J. Newman,
12. Lancaster, John – 60561	15 ½ Burnell Street – SAB	Hardscaping: fence	73.4.2-48	D. Galvin
13. Sheridan, Paul & Rachel – 60562 *	17 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Cabana & shower	* 73-109	Atlantic Landscape
14. Red Horse LLC – 60563	10 Lincoln Street – SAB	Hardscaping: gate	73.4.2-87	Botticelli & Pohl
15. Sullivan, Jim – 60564 *	64 Sankaty Road – SAB	Material change: roof	* 49-80.1	Thornewill
16. Weymer, Helmut – 60565	79 Baxter Road – SAB	Rev: COA #60389	49-32	Emeritus
17. Atlantic Construction – 60566	70 Bunker Road – SAB	Shed	78-116	Structures Unltd.
18. Langden – 60567	5 Bunker Hill – SAB	Material change: garage roof	73.4.2-33	
19. Benson, Marlene – 60568	13 R Burnell Street – SAB	Color Change-all structures	73.4.2-89	Permits Plus
20. Benson, Marlene – 60569	13 R Burnell Street – SAB	Egress windows	73.4.2-89	Permits Plus
21. DeAngelis, John & Susan – 60570	109 Baxter Road – SAB	Relocate building on lot	48-12	J. Cabral
22. Lawrason, Lee – 60571 *	14 Center Street – SAB	A/C unit	* 73.1.3-104	Self
23. Lawrason, Lee – 60572	14 Center Street – SAB	Window	73.1.3-104	Self
24. Vandenberg, R & S – 60573	2 Hedge Row – SAB	Bulkhead foundation/doors	73.3.2-37.2	W. Morris
25. Kija, Kim – 60574	3 Starbuck Road – MAB	Shed	60-21	V. Oliver
26. Schweizer – 60575	6 Jefferson Street	New foundation	29-49.1	J. Stover
27. King, Edward – 60576 *	69 Milestone Road	Addition	* 68-28.3	B. Meerbergen
28. McHugh, James – 60577 *	26 Western Avenue	Covered porch/deck	* 87-88	B. Meerbergen
29. Baker, Jonas – 60578	9 Pine Grove Road	Full basement	67-243	Self
30. Miller, Marlin – 60579	66 Quidnet Road	Demolish garage	21-10	Rowland & Assoc
31. Rubin, Joan – 60580 *	20 Sherburne Turnpike	Rev: COA #60123	* 30-195	Thornewill Design

Minutes for November 12, 2013, adopted Nov. 26

32. Gastow, Deborah – 60581	40 Madequecham Vy Rd.	Rev: COA #60412	89-26	Thornewill Design
33. McNeil, Rory & Jane – 60582	24 Osprey Way	Addition to storage shed	83-29.4	S. Erisman
34. Lombardi, David – 60583 *	22 Field Avenue	Cabana	* 80-108	Lombardi
35. Boxer, Kenneth – 60584	68 Cliff Road	Hardscaping: fence	30-67	D. Galvin
36. Jelleme – 60585	Pilgrim Court (Lot 2)	Rev: COA #60303	41-612	Emeritus
37. Jordan – 60586	39 Sheep Pond Road	Rev: COA #60225	63-39.1	Emeritus
38. Norris, Mark – 60587	51 Vestal Street	Pool house door change	41-185.4	Emeritus
39. 5 E Lincoln Ave Trust – 60588	5 East Lincoln Avenue	Shed	42.4.1-9	Emeritus
40. Gaucher/Niemietz – 60589	15 Boulvarde	Shed	80-244	Structures Unltd.
41. Wagner – 60590	7 South Valley Road	Move off: garage	43-142	Structures Unltd.
42. Oshinsky, William – 60591	6 Green Hollow	Deck 8 x 8 addition	71-48	V. Oliver
43. Burns – 60592	24 Nonantum Avenue	Revisions to COA 60395	87-157	Emeritus
44. Burns – 60593 *	24 Nonantum Avenue	New garage	* 87-157	Emeritus
45. Pierce, Marco – 60594	77 Polpis Road	Renovation	44-23.2	BPC
46. Flesher, Laura – 60595	52 Goldfinch Drive	Hardscaping	68-675	T. Hanlon
47. Sabelhaus, Melanie – 60596	19 North Pasture Lane	Pool & hardscape	44-73	Garden Design

II. * CONDITIONS FOR CONSENT (SEE ABOVE)

4. Doughan, Susan	16 Orange Street	Rev: COA #60125	Lack of visibility
11. Bednar, Andrew	38 Orange Street	Color change	Shutters to match historic photo
13. Sheridan, Paul	17 Blackfish Lane	Cabana & shower	With solid board ntw fence around pool
15. Sullivan, Jim	64 Sankaty Road	Material change: roof	Hold in office until main house change to wood
22. Lawrason, Lee	14 Center Street	A/C unit	A/C units screened by ntw lattice 1-2" vert/horz lattice
27. King, Edward	69 Milestone Road	Addition	Reduce size of skylight to vertical max 24" x 36"
28. McHugh, James	26 Western Avenue	Covered porch/deck	No shingled rail, only open rail, deck back one (1) foot
31. Rubin, Joan	20 Sherburne Turnpike	Rev: COA #60123	Lack of visibility
34. Lombardi, David	22 Field Avenue	Cabana	Lack of visibility
44. Burns	24 Nonantum Avenue	New garage	Change brackets to 45 deg straight
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp		
Alternates	None		
Recused	Leonardo-Finger		
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.		
Representing	Item 5: Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Presented alternative fenestration for the south elevation.		
Public	None		
Concerns	Item 5: Barham – The large picture units are a concern. Prefer the double hung. Coombs – Like the way they used to look. McLaughlin – The approved is better. Williams – Likes the way they used to look.		
Motion	Motion to Approve with those indicated by an * through staff per comments. (Coombs) Motion to Reconsider Item 5. (Barham) Carried unanimously Motion to Approve Item 5 as submitted. (Barham)		
Vote	Carried 4-0/McLaughlin abstain	Certificate #	60550 to 60596
	Item 5: Carried 4-0/McLaughlin abstain		

III. OLD BUSINESS: HELD FOR QUORUM

1. Taaffe, James & Mary	20 Boulvarde	Pool house, fence, gate	80-82	Thornewill Design
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:12) No quorum (Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs)			
Motion	Held for Tuesday November 19.			
Vote	N/A	Certificate #		

2. Thirty Nine Hulbert LLC	39 Hulbert Avenue	New dwelling	29-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:13) Staff – Read previous concerns from Oct. 15. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60597	
3. Maxey Pond Realty LLC	9 Maxey Pond Road	Garage	40-103	Rowland & Assoc
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:15) No quorum (Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs)			
Motion	Held for Tuesday November 19.			
Vote	N/A	Certificate #		
4. Murray, John	4 Mikes Drive	New dwelling	66-76	J. Murray
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	John Murray , Owner – Reviewed changes.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:15) Barham – Sidelights should be eliminated. Otherwise okay due to location and minimal visibility. Coombs – Nothing to add.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the sidelights at the front door removed. (Coombs0			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60598	
5. Goldberg	156 Orange Street	Revisions: dwelling	55-61	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed revisions to the deck.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:19) Staff – Read previous concerns. Barham – Proposed posts on east elevation are half the width of those next to them.			
Motion	Motion to Approve with the east elevation new porch posts to match existing posts to the north. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60599	

6. Fogarty	19 Masaquet Avenue	New dwelling	80-140	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:22) Staff – Read previous concerns from Oct. 10. Barham – West elevation, there should be a break in the eave height between the main mass and the additive mass; “E” windows should be smaller; double-ganged “B” windows stand out as the only ganged units. French doors on the south elevation should have kick panels. Coombs – Agree with Mr. Barham. Would like to see it come down to 26 feet to be more in compliance with the Surfside Area Plan. Chimney should be interior. Williams – West and east elevation roofs are wide 12/12 pitch; proportions don’t work. East elevation, will be visible. “A” windows are not appropriate anywhere, they are too large. South elevation French doors and chimney should be centered and the doors should be at least 6 lights. The multiple types of roof planes are too busy.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
7. Gammill, Cameron	87 Somerset Road	Addition	66-79	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:33) Staff – Read previous concerns from Oct 10. Williams – The 12-over-12 windows are too ornate; windows should be 6-over-6 with vertical panes. Barham – Agree about the 6-over-6 windows. Coombs – Agree.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with all windows to be 6-over-6 with vertical panes. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60600	
8. Fraker	12 Mt. Vernon Street – HSAB	Revisions	55.4.1-35	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Mark Poor , Permits Plus – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:36) Staff – Read previous concerns from Oct. 1. Barham – South elevation, the rear shed dormer doglegs toward the yard will be visible and therefore not approvable. The north elevation shed dormer with the double window ends right into the broken back; should be 6 inches thinner and away from that other roof. McLaughlin – The east elevation egress will be visible. (Poor – contends it won’t be visible.) Camp – No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation dormer left wall pulled back 6 inches and the window centered. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60601	

9. Shuttleworth, Paul & Teri	112 Somerset Road	New dwelling	66-223	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. New southwest elevation proposal submitted at table.			
Representing	Doug Mills , BPC – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Paul Shuttleworth			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:43) Staff – Read previous concerns from Oct. 22. Leonardo-Finger – The rafter tails make it too busy. The structure is too long and doesn't fit with the neighborhood. Northwest elevation, the small left dormer doesn't work. Southwest elevation, the dormer with 3-lights doesn't work. The 2-light windows in the garage are awkward. The barn style doesn't fit on this street. Coombs – Agree with Ms Leonardo-Finger. The "C" windows are the wrong shape. Southeast elevation, "B" windows on the 2 nd floor are too large to be mulled and the same with the windows below. The house should be turned so that the length isn't facing the short side of the property; it takes up a very large amount of land. A barn-like building doesn't work in this area. Camp – Agree with what's been said. The new southwest elevation proposal is an improvement. Barham – The problem with the proposed southwest elevation is that there are no other Greek Revival elements anywhere on the structure. Southwest elevation shed dormer needs to relate better to the roof. If there are going to be rafter tails, need the flying rafters over the dormer. Agree that this doesn't feel like a barn. Pent roof over the garage is too suburban for a barn structure. Williams – This should not be a barn; there never was a barn in this area. It is alien to the neighborhood, which has mostly capes. This is 92 feet long without the garage; attaching the garage is completely inappropriate.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

10. Dunning, John	5 N. Liberty St – HSAB	Move on –site, addition	42.3.4-7	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:00) No quorum (Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Coombs)			
Motion	Held for Tuesday November 19.			
Vote	N/A		Certificate #	

14. Beardsley, Scott	138 Main Street – HSAB	Hardscaping	41-521	Edgewater
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:00) No previous minutes. Last heard Sept. 10.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for November 19 to determine who sat. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

15. Domboys R.T. 2B Winn Street Rev: COA #57657 41-183 BPC
 Sitting Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp
 Alternates Leonardo-Finger
 Recused None
 Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.
 Representing **Doug Mills, BPC** – Reviewed application changes caught during inspection.
 Public None
 Concerns (6:03) **Barham** – It is inappropriate to replace a typical Nantucket door with an off-the-shelf Victorian door. There is no lintel over the door or capitals left and right of the door. Stated he would not have approved this door on this house in this location. It should be made appropriate to the neighborhood and the shutters put back on.
Coombs – Agrees.
McLaughlin – No comment.
Camp – Agrees with Mr. Barham and Ms Coombs.
 Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)**
 Vote Carried unanimously **Certificate #**

16. Grimshaw, Gloria 2C Winn Street Rev: COA #58838 41-183 BPC
 Sitting Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.
 Representing **Doug Mills, BPC** – Reviewed project, changes caught during inspection.
 Public None
 Concerns (6:10) **Barham** – What was approved was simple, handsome and appropriate. There is mock column trim under the lintel, jam stock is heavier, sidelights are heavier; it all looks wrong. This is a very traditionally designed structure. The shutters should be put on the windows on the west elevation.
McLaughlin – The north and south elevations don't show the 8 or 10 inch overhangs; there is a drawing error.
Coombs – What is above the door is totally inappropriate. Shutters should go back on, they make the house.
Camp – Agree about the door surround.
 Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)**
 Vote Carried unanimously **Certificate #**

Motion to move Item IV.22. forward to the end of old business. (Barham) Carried unanimously

17. NHA Properties 75 Old South Road Solar P/V installation 68-999.1 A. Kuzpa
 Sitting Williams, McLaughlin, Camp
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.
 Representing None
 Public None
 Concerns (6:16) **Camp** – Thinks the array is approvable due to the location.
McLaughlin – Still believes it is visible and should go on the ground.
 Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with the panels reduced to 5 and centered and the exhaust pipe removed. (Camp)**
 Vote Carried 2-1/McLaughlin opposed **Certificate # 60602**

IV. NEW BUSINESS: AUTOMATIC VIEWS RETURN 11/19/13

1. Leo, Lori	7 Bluebird Lane	New dwelling	68-587	Self
2. Lethbridge, Francis	48 Orange Street – HSAB	Renovation/addition	42.3.2-97	Skehel
3. Miner, Tim	12 S. Valley Road	Hardscaping: pool	43-139	B Champoux
4. Corbie Ack	10 Salros Road	New storage building	67-107	SCI/R. Newman
5. Dowsett, Robert	3 Farmer Street – HSAB	Rev: COA #59832	42.3.2-159	Design Assoc.
6. Dowsett, Robert	3 Farmer Street – HSAB	Hardscaping: fence/gate	42.3.2-159	Design Assoc.
7. Dowsett, Robert	3 Farmer Street – HSAB	Rev: COA #	42.3.2-159	Design Assoc.
8. Lampe, John	1 John Adams Lane	Hardscaping: pool	30-170.1	Atlantic Landscape
9. Hayden, Thomas/Nancy	7 North Point	Addition, deck	38-81	CWA
10. 4 Cato Lane LLC	4 Cato lane	New dwelling	55-661	V. Oliver
11. Frazier, Pepper	7 Plum Street	New dwelling	80-26	BPC
12. Williams, Fred	8 Tashama Lane	Additions	55-477	Brook

Minutes for November 12, 2013, adopted Nov. 26

13. Swietlik, Albert	23 Old South Road	Addition	68-78	V. Oliver
14. Webster	2 Prospect Street – HSAB	Move on: garage	55.4.4-3	Structures
15. ViaVai LLC	11 Crooked Lane	New dwelling	41-205	BPC
16. Preserve ACK	15 Meader Street – HSAB	New dwelling	42.2.3-45	BPC
17. Preserve ACK	15 Meader Street – HSAB	New dwelling	42.2.3-45	BPC
18. Fortune Cookie LLC	5 Main Street – SAB	Renovation/addition	73.2.4-1	Botticelli & Pohl
19. 79 Eel Pt. Rd. N.T.	79 Eel Point Road	Move off: main house	32-44	Botticelli & Pohl
20. 14 Bishops Rise LLC	19 Bishops Rise	Move on (from 14 Bishops)	40-124	V. Oliver
21. 79 Eel Pt. Rd. N.T.	79 Eel Point Road	Move off: guest house	32-44	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to View with poles worked out through staff and the chair. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

V. NEW BUSINESS

1. Cape Cod Five	112 Pleasant Street	Enclosure for site items	55-149	B L F & R Arch.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Arthur Reade , Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP – Reviewed discrepancies listed by HDC assistant administrator. Chris Raber , Cape Cod Five – Explained the conflicts between the Planning Board approved landscape and HDC approved landscape. Some items will take 2 or 3 months to correct. Bill Hourihan, Brown, Lindquist, Fenucci & Raber Architects Kurt Raber, Brown, Lindquist, Fenucci & Raber Architects			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:22) Staff – Read application specifications. Williams – Stated that James Grieder, Assistant Administrator HDC, toured the site and listed the discrepancies between the HDC approved hardscape plan and what is existing. Further explained the reasoning for her and Leslie Snell viewing the site and the plans. The idea is to allow a temporary Certificate of Occupancy (CO) and place a time-limit by when corrections will be made. Have been asked by PLUS Administrator to expedite the application to allow issuance of a temporary CO. Would like to see a copy of the National Grid template for placement of the bollards around the transformer and the generator. McLaughlin – Wants to see the report generated by Mr. Grieder. Barham – Agrees with Mr. McLaughlin. Stated he has noticed what looked to be architectural departures from the HDC approval on the building; those need to be addressed before the hard/landscape is approved. Does not think this commercial project should be held at a lower standard to which this board holds homeowners. Is very uncomfortable with issuing an approval that would allow a temporary CO. Coombs – Asked questions that clarify the application. Would like to know if the building architecturally complies with the HDC approval. Can agree with what they are asking as long as there are no architectural issues.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of November 14 meeting. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

2. Island Reality	44 Pine Street – HSAB	Add basement window	55.4.1-185	D. Wiley
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:48) HSAB – No concerns. Barham – Window setting should be set flush to the brick and foundation material match existing.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the foundation material to match existing and existing material reused when possible, and the window to be flat-cased and flush with the outside of the foundation wall. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60603	
3. Hodges	6 West York Lane – HSAB	Roof material change	55-14	M. Bourke
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Martin Bourke			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:53) HSAB – Use of architectural shingles does not meet guidelines; not appropriate in Old Historic District (OHD). Barham – Okay with black architectural shingling due to the location. McLaughlin – No comments. Coombs – Agrees with Mr. Barham Camp – Stated she doesn't want to approve architectural in OHD.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to location and neighborhood context. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried 4-1/Camp opposed	Certificate #	60604	
4. FAO Nominee Trust	3 Cash's Court – HSAB	New garage	72.3.2-150	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	Chris Skehel abutter – It is very difficult to see this structure.			
Concerns	(6:55) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Incomplete application, no photos. Barham – The way it is designed, it is not appropriate to the OHD. Proportions are incorrect and appropriateness of sighting is questionable. Doors are 8'2", too high. McLaughlin – No comments. Coombs – Believes it will be hard to see. Williams – Has no concerns as it is low and wood, a huge improvement over what was there.			
Motion	Motion to View. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
Break 7:01 to 7:11 p.m.				

5.	Brewster, Jeanmarie	25 Walsh Street	Driveway apron as-built	29-35	Self
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Want to focus on the apron. The retaining wall is not part of this application.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(7:11) Staff – Read application specifications. Williams – It is a Belgium block apron and retaining wall that were not approved. The apron is raised 2 inches. Barham – Belgium Block is not appropriate for the neighborhood. Discussion about replacing the Belgium Block with cobble stone. Williams – Wants the removal of the retaining wall to be part of the motion.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the unapproved retaining wall removed or applied for and the apron to be spaced cobblestone with no edging, and the driveway to be shell. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60605	
6.	Bamber, Ronald K	3 West Creek Road	Material/color change: roof	55-168	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns	(7:20) Williams – Presented that this is the dentist building going to dual grey architectural roof. Staff – Read application states 3-tabs. Coombs – Do not think Architectural is suitable there. Camp – Not in favor of architectural. Barham – No comment. McLaughlin – Should be black architectural.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff as 3-tab dual grey. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60606	
7.	Lynch, Michael	58A Orange Street – HSAB	Rev. COA 60335: Dormers	55.4.1-792	SMRD
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Alternate proposal submitted at table.				
Representing	Steve Roethke , S.M. Roethke Design – Presented project. Sarah Alger, Sarah F. Alger P.C. Michael Lynch, owner				
Public	Steven Cohen , Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP, for 67 Orange Street – Client is concerned with the height of the building. Asks the HDC to consider the apparent massing.				
Concerns	(7:23) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Out of scale; should remain 1 or 1½ stories. Coombs – Do not think it should have the dormers. Do not think any dormers that are visible are appropriate. McLaughlin – Fine design for the neighborhood. All four dormers are visible, but no concerns. Camp – Proposed drawing is too far from the original structure; the previous approval is more in keeping with the old structure. Barham – Agree with Ms Coombs and Ms Camp. Too much for the site; the 3 rd -floor dormers add to the apparent height. Do not accept the assertion that the rear elevation is not visible. Williams – Rear is not visible. Hipped dormers originally approved were more appropriate.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions by request of the applicant. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried 2-2/Barham & Camp opposed		Certificate #		

8. Beller, Gary	3 Willard Street	Awnings on rear	42.4.1-18
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp		
Alternates	None		
Recused	None		
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.		
Representing	None		
Public	None		
Concerns	None		
Motion	Motion to Hold for November 14 at 1 p.m. (Coombs)		
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	

9. MacFarlane, Dudley	15 Lyford Road – SAB	Misc changes	92.4-86	Finlay Arch.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Jay Valade – Presented project. Andrew Schumacher			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:35) Staff – Read application specifications. Williams – Extension of the deck and sidelights on the front door kept this off the consent agenda. Barham – Some of the shutters are the full width of the 6-over-6 ganged windows. The 2 nd floor shutters should be eliminated; the 1 st floor shutters are handsome and can stay. Would prefer the sidelights to be paneled to the level of the knob. The deck at grade is no concern. Williams – The sidelights should be single pane width. Deck should not exceed 8 feet in depth. McLaughlin – Deck needs to be pulled back to 8 feet deep.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the 2nd-floor shutters removed, 2nd-floor left elevation deck reduced to 8 feet in depth from the exterior wall, deck at grade is approved, and the sidelights at the front door should be three high and 1 pane wide to match the window panes and with a solid panel below. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60607	

10. Mukkavilli, Ganga	8 Milestone Road	Window & door chg/dormer	54-47	Rowland & Assoc.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ben Normand , Rowland and Associates – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:49) Staff – Read application specifications. Barham – South and east elevations, no concerns. West elevation, the balcony shouldn't move toward the rear; it will be more visible and it straddles a porch and enclosed area; preferred the originally approved location. Consensus agrees.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff all changes except the west elevation 2nd-floor deck railing and door to remain as previously approved on COA 59988. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60608	

11. Congdon, William	Tuckernuck Island	New Dwelling	94-11	Thornewill Design
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Carrie Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:56) Staff – Read application specifications. Barham – Do not feel it is an appropriate design in that landscape. The saltbox proportions are not of traditional form. Raised deck over the front door is poorly proportion. Type 1 windows are oversized. The double French doors of the 2 nd floor overwhelm the front door. Front door looks like it is in a utility space with no windows. North elevation, gable housing with triple window is over sized; the ridge goes to the top of the saltbox form; the combo of Type 1 and Type 3 are miss matched; the dormer is top heavy. North and east are okay though the windows should align vertically. McLaughlin – Okay with the saltbox style. Coombs – This stands out in the middle of the low lands; the 2 nd floor deck is unnecessary. The windows are too large for the walls. Front door needs windows. Agree with Mr. Barham. Camp – Agree with Mr. Barham. The new house should reflect some of the wonderful architecture that exists on Tuckernuck. Williams – Contends visibility will be slim to none as it sits 800 feet from the water in an area of new upside down houses; stated all that should be taken into consideration. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
12. McElvie, A.	6 Candlehouse Lane – HSAB	Roof change	55.4.4-52.1	M. Golaski
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Mark Golaski – Asking for black architectural shingles.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:08) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Architectural shingles are not appropriate in OHD and incomplete application, no historic information.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff as black 3-tab. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60609
13. Donald Dimock	42 Bartlett Road	Move on (from 10 Salros)	66-530	D. Dimock
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Donald Dimock , owner – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:09) Barham – Should have drawings of the structure with the proposed changes.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for November 14. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

14. Desert Island LLC	13 Derrymore Rd	Hardscape: patio	41-125	Thornewill Design
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Carrie Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:14) Staff – Read application specifications. Barham – Recalled the previous discussion about the position and size of the patio and why it is not appropriate. Not in favor of the enlarged patio in this location. McLaughlin – No comments. Coombs – Do not think the patio is attractive on the corner; should be rearranged and reshaped to follow the hedge. Camp – No objections. Williams – Too large; should be reduce 6 feet in depth and 2 feet on each side.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
15. Palermo, John & Julie	49A Pleasant Street – HSAB	Alterations	55-19.1	Self (mail)
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	John Palermo , owner – Presented project. Explained how the attic vents would be installed. Julie Palermo			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:23) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Application incomplete, no historic information. Need photos. Architectural shingles and simulated divided light (SDL) windows and the slider not appropriate in the OHD. McLaughlin – Okay with the double-hung windows on the front; okay with the side window. Exterior can be either shingle or clapboard. Coombs – There are three sides that will be easy to do; it comes down to the placing of the front windows. Roof should be 3-tab. Suggested putting a new chimney in. Barham – Need a full set of elevation drawings that show the new windows. The materials need to be natural. A cupola is not appropriate on this structure. Roof needs to be 3-tab. The application is incomplete. Camp – Would like to see a reference to the old structure in the new design. Would like the chimney to remain.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and more information. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
16. Benson, Marlene	13 R Burnell Street – SAB	Change front door	73.4.2-89	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to Hold for November 14 at 1 p.m. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

17. 54 Fair Street LLC	54 Fair Street – HSAB	Move Building	55.4.1-14	C. Skehel
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chris Skehel , The Castle Group – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:41) Staff – Read application specifications. Application is missing information. HSAB – Need historical information. Recommend view. Would like to see application again. Not in favor of lifting. Need to see a streetscape. Barham – The big consideration is the appropriateness of how much it is raised off the ground; that contributes to the historic context of the area. Not sure the treatment of friendship stairs is appropriate. It is reasonable to put a basement under it. Would like to view. Would like confirmation of when it was built and when it was renovated.			
Motion	Motion to View with historic information. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
18. Kelly, Art & Diane	22 Main Street – SAB	Roof shingles	73.3.1-49	E. McMorrow
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ethan McMorrow			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:50) Staff – Read application specifications. SAB – No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with 3-tab weatherwood. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60610	
19. Jayne Lane	69 Easton Street – HSAB	Raise House	42.4.1-111	E. McMorrow
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ethan McMorrow			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:51) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Chimney is a defining feature of the structure for its period and should not be removed. Coombs – No concerns. McLaughlin – No comment. Camp – Would like to see the chimney remain.			
Motion	Motion to Approve with vertical board natural to weather skirt. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60611	
20. McClusky, Katherine	3 Traders Lane – HSAB	Renovate	42.3.3-116	Bockus
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to Hold for November 14 at 1 p.m. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

21. Benedict, Bruce	10E Crows Nest Way	Addition	12-44.2	J. Murray
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	John Murray – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:55) Staff – Read application specifications. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60612	

22. Red Horse LLC	10 Lincoln Street – SAB	Addition	73.4.2-87	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:59) SAB – No concerns. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60613	

23. Foley & Doliner	8 Charter Street – HSAB	Addition	42.3.2-165	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project. Reviewed the history of the structure and additions.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(9:01) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Incomplete information; need historic information and photos. Would like the application to come back. Recommend view. Front door should remain intact. Barham – Wished the proposed eave could be lower. Would have no problem with the west elevation rear corner ganged windows provided they are not visible; looks better without it. South elevation, there is not 3 feet from the gable to the dormer, would need to view. Thinks the door surround and trim should be historically accurate for this structure. Coombs – Agrees with Mr. Barham. Camp – North elevation 4-over-4 windows should have panes that match the rest of the windows.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and details on the door surround. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

Motion to Hold the following for November 14 at 1 p.m. (Coombs) Carried unanimously

24. Morris, Joan Et al	18 Tautemo Way	Dormer & minor alterations	82-1	V. Oliver
25. 21 Lincoln Avenue N.T.	21 Lincoln Avenue	Demo/re-build beach stairs	30-43	Botticelli & Pohl
26. 21 Lincoln Avenue N.T.	21 Lincoln Avenue	Revisions to 59157	30-43	Botticelli & Pohl
27. 21 Lincoln Avenue N.T.	21 Lincoln Avenue	Revisions to 59751	30-43	Botticelli & Pohl
28. Mastellone, Michael	74 N Liberty Street – HSAB	Add to second floor	41-236	V. Oliver
29. Kaplan	37 Hulbert Avenue	Addition	29-20	Emeritus
30. Frazier	73 Hooper Farm Road Lot A	Windows/trim/color	67-330	Emeritus
31. Kahan	19 Bishops Rise	Major revisions	40-31.3	Emeritus
32. Keefe, Carol	16 Osprey Way	Alterations to garage	83-21	V. Oliver
33. McOllum House Trust	35 Eel Point Road	Fenestration revisions	32-63	Botticelli & Pohl
34. Taylor, Levin	25 Hussey Street – HSAB	Hardscaping	42.3.4-54	T. Hanlon
35. Wesquo Prop A LLC	5 N. Liberty Street – HSAB	Hardscape	42.4.4-7	Cottage & Castle
36. Providence Assoc LLC	7 Village Way	Pool/Hardscape	14-4	Cottage & Castle
37. Dyer, Paul	20 Tashama Lane	Revisions to Cert 27412	55-450	Link
38. Dyer, Paul	20 Tashama Lane	Revisions to Cert 33491	55-450	Link

VI. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes	October 22, 24 & 29 - held
Review Minutes	November 5
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Executive Session: Status and clarification of 8 Milestone Road• Discussion on agenda/meeting composition: not segregating old/new business meetings• 8 North Water Street hardscaping/ granite curbing in OHD• 82 Main Street discussion of status of structure
Comments	None

Motion to Adjourn: 9:12 p.m.

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board

SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board

TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board

MAB – Madaket Advisory Board